

Winter 1-21-2015

# White Paper: Furthering Indonesian Higher Education through the Liberal Arts

A Chaedar Alwasilah PhD

*Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia*, chaedar\_alwasilah@upi.edu

Judith Puncochar

*Northern Michigan University*, jpuncoch@nmu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: [http://commons.nmu.edu/facwork\\_other](http://commons.nmu.edu/facwork_other)

 Part of the [Higher Education Commons](#), [International and Comparative Education Commons](#), and the [Liberal Studies Commons](#)

---

## Recommended Citation

Alwasilah, A. C., & Puncochar, J. (2015). White paper: Furthering Indonesian higher education through the Liberal Arts. Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, West Java, Indonesia

This Other is brought to you for free and open access by The Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Other by an authorized administrator of The Commons. For more information, please contact [kclumpne@nmu.edu](mailto:kclumpne@nmu.edu), [kmcdonou@nmu.edu](mailto:kmcdonou@nmu.edu), [mburgmei@nmu.edu](mailto:mburgmei@nmu.edu), [bsarjean@nmu.edu](mailto:bsarjean@nmu.edu).

# Furthering Indonesian Higher Education through the Liberal Arts

“Pendidikan Umum dalam Menyongsong Generasi Emas Indonesia Tahun 2045”

By

Prof. A. Chaedar Alwasilah, M.A., Ph.D.



Prof. Judith Puncochar, Ph.D.



21 January 2015

- To: Minister Anies Baswedan, M.A., Ph.D., Indonesian Minister of Culture and Education  
 Minister M. Nasir, M.A., Ph.D., Indonesian Minister of Research, Technology & Higher Education  
 Universitas Indonesia (UI) Rector: Prof. Dr. Ir. Muhammad Anis, M.Met.  
 Universitas Katolik Parahyangan (UNPAR) Rector: Prof. Robertus Wahyudi Triweko, Ir., M.Eng., Ph.D.  
 Universitas Pasundan (UNPAS) Rector: Prof. Dr Ir. H. Eddy Yusuf Sp., M.Sc.  
 Universitas Pembangunan Jaya (UPJ) Rector: Rector Prof. Gunawan Tjahjono, M.Arch., Ph.D.  
 Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia (UPI) Rector: Prof. Dr. Sunaryo Kartadinata, M.Pd.  
 Yayasan Sahabat Lingkungan Hidup (YSLH Eco Camp) Founder: Romo Ferry Sutrisna Widjaja Pr.
- Cc: UI Dean: Dr. Rer. Nat. Abdul Haris, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences  
 UI Dean: Dr. Tjut Rifameutia Umar Ali, M.A., Faculty of Psychology  
 UI Vice-Dean: Dr. Corina D. S. Riantoputra, M.Com, Ph.D., Resources, Venture, & Gen. Admin.  
 UNPAS Dean: Dr. Senny Suzana Alwasilah, UNPAS Faculty of Arts and Letters  
 UPI Dean Prof. Dr. Karim Suryadi, M.Si., Faculty of Social Science Education  
 UPI Dean: Dr. Edi Suryadi, M.Si., Faculty of Economic and Business Education  
 UPI Dean: Dr. Eng. Agus Setiawan, M.Si., Faculty of Technology and Vocational Education  
 UPI Dean: Dr. Yunyun Yudiana, M.Pd., Faculty of Sports and Health Science Education  
 UPI Dean: Prof. Dr. Ahman, M.Pd., Faculty of Educational Sciences  
 UPI Dean: Prof. Dr. Didi Sukyadi, M.A., Faculty of Language and Arts Education  
 UPI Dean: Prof. Dr. R. Asep Kadarrohman, M.Si., Faculty of Mathematics & Science Education  
 UPI Director: Prof. Dr. Didi Suryadi, M.Ed., School of Postgraduate Studies  
 UPI Director: Dr. Abas Asyafah, M.Pd., Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum  
 UPJ Head: Prof. Mayling Oey-Gardiner, Ph.D., Liberal Arts Center  
 Members of Society for Enhancement of Indonesian Citizenry through Higher Education  
 Members of UPI Faculty Focus Groups on Furthering the Liberal Arts in Higher Education

Address correspondence to Prof. Judith Puncochar, Ph.D. (jpuncoch@nmu.edu)  
 Northern Michigan University, 1401 Presque Isle Avenue, Marquette, MI 49855 USA

## Table of Contents

Preface .....	3
Signature Page .....	5
Values of Higher Education.....	6
Society for Enhancement of Indonesian Citizenry through Higher Education .....	7
Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum (MKDU) as Liberal Arts .....	8
Structure of Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum (MKDU) at UPI .....	10
Recommendations for MKDU Religion Classes.....	12
Recommendations for Teaching Bahasa Indonesia in the MKDU .....	13
Social Services Engagement as an Expected MKDU Outcome.....	15
Teaching for Learning in University Classrooms .....	17
Research Proposal, Prospectus, Thesis, and Dissertation Guidelines.....	19
Formatting a Thesis or Dissertation .....	25
Community Ventures with University Competitive Grants .....	26
Indonesian Civic Fellows Scholarship.....	27
Outcomes Assessment of Higher Education Learning .....	27
Teacher Education Programs Have a Critical Need for the Liberal Arts .....	28
Educational Policy Recommendations.....	29
References .....	31

## Preface

Access to Indonesian education has improved greatly since the colonial education of European children and privileged others. Free compulsory education through 12<sup>th</sup> grade will begin in fall 2015 for all Indonesian children. Students in Indonesian high schools will increase steadily over the next four years. The first cohort of high school graduates under the new compulsory education law will be ready for college in 2019. They will have experienced an increasing number of inquiry-based, student-centered lessons in all high school subjects. Primary and secondary teacher improvement efforts will continue to advance under the leadership of Anis Baswedan, Indonesia's current Minister of Culture and Education.

Higher education must prepare financially for a new wave of highly talented students of lower socioeconomic status who will need tuition reductions through work-study and scholarship support. Teacher education programs will face tighter standards in teacher quality and an expanding expectation of general knowledge for elementary and secondary education majors. Lecturers of general education university classes within the nationally mandated Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum (MKDU) will encounter first-year undergraduates who each year are progressively more skilled in science inquiry, social media, and student-centered lessons.

MKDU began in Indonesia as Liberal Arts classes, but withered to a series of mind numbing, boring lectures of potential "passive indoctrination"<sup>1</sup>. MKDU programs strive to develop the ethical, cultural, scientific, critical social consciousness of Indonesian students, but university students typically evaluate MKDU classes as easy and boring. Some students sleep during class or engage in social media sites on cell phones. A few universities have restructured the MKDU with the Liberal Arts (e.g., Universitas Indonesia and Universitas Pembangunan Jaya). These efforts are laudatory, but may fall short of intended Liberal Arts learning outcomes in the absence of MKDU instructor training in teaching with higher-level thinking strategies and structured groupwork that works<sup>2</sup>.

Liberal Arts are subjects and skills considered essential for an educated citizenry to participate in civic activities of a democracy and economic growth of nation. A report in 2014 by the Association of American Colleges and Universities and the National Center for Higher Education Management Systems argues that students who pursue majors within the context of a Liberal Arts education substantially increase their likelihood of achieving long-term professional success.<sup>3</sup> Liberal

---

<sup>1</sup> Setiadi, E. M., Hakam, K. A., & Effendi, R. (2006). *Ilmu sosial budaya dasar* [Sociology and the Foundations of Culture]. Jakarta, Indonesia: Kencana Prenadamedia Group, p. 3.

<sup>2</sup> Puncuchar, J. (2006, May 9-12). *Groupwork that works!* Workshop presented for the 32<sup>nd</sup> Annual Spring Conference of the Michigan Mid-America Educational Opportunity Program, NMU, Marquette, MI USA

<sup>3</sup> Association of American Colleges and Universities. (2014). *New report documents that Liberal Arts disciplines prepare graduates for long-term professional success*. Retrieved from <https://www.aacu.org/press/press-releases/new-report-documents-liberal-arts-disciplines-prepare-graduates-long-term>

Arts could play a leading role in improving the social and economic fabric of Indonesia and the quality of Indonesia's educational systems.

MKDU lecturers rarely receive training necessary to teach higher-level reasoning strategies or skills for debate, collaboration, and constructive controversy. MKDU classes are limited in credit hours and have insufficient classes and subjects to prepare an educated Indonesian citizenry for *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika (Unity in Diversity)* and participation in a vibrant democracy.

Most Indonesian universities have failed to instill a foundation of Liberal Arts outcomes for undergraduate learning and have failed to identify the great literary works of Indonesia<sup>4</sup>. In the USA, undergraduates complete at least 25% of their coursework in the Liberal Arts. USA undergraduates read the Great Books (e.g., Cervantes's *Don Quixote*, *Gilgamesh*, Plato's *Republic*, or Dante's *Divine Comedy*) selected from a foundation of Western cultural literature typically consisting of 100–150 volumes. Indonesian graduate students had a great deal of difficulty identifying 20 Great Books of Indonesia. Most graduate students used best sellers lists, opinions of friends, or books made into movies to complete the assignment<sup>5</sup>.

Improving the quality of an Indonesian university education requires improvements in MKDU instruction and an approved, robust MKDU curriculum. Instructors of MKDU classes must know how to teach for learning and how to hone undergraduate skills of inquiry, critical thinking, problem solving, and decision-making. The MKDU curriculum must have an approved, integrated program of Liberal Arts outcomes-based coursework to support and enhance students' specialized areas of study. The MKDU should have annual assessments of Liberal Arts learning outcomes. An effective MKDU would provide evidence of students' skills for lifelong learning and evidence of an increasingly educated Indonesian citizenry. Establishing the Liberal Arts in the MKDU would have a favorable influence on Indonesia's status as an international leader of higher education.

Recommendations in our report are theory-based and research-driven<sup>6</sup>. Data from UPI faculty focus groups and data from UPI and UNPAS students address the urgency of change needed in Indonesian universities, specifically in the MKDU. In addition, this report contains recommendations for thesis and dissertation research processes, outcomes assessment of higher education programs, and improvements to teacher education programs. Prof. Judith Puncochar (jpuncoch@nmu.edu) will return in 2016-2017 to work toward continuous quality improvement efforts in "teaching for learning" within Indonesian higher education.

---

<sup>4</sup> Alwasilah, A. C. (2012, July 21). In Indonesia, liberal studies are unfortunately neglected. *Jakarta Post*. Retrieved from <http://www.thejakartapost.com>

<sup>5</sup> Alwasilah, A. C., & Puncochar, J. (2014, October 9). *Assignment for the Liberal Arts Seminar: What are Indonesia's Great Books?* Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, West Java, Indonesia.

<sup>6</sup> Puncochar, J. (2014). *Liberal Arts in Indonesian higher education*. Research Proposal Approval: HS14-616. Institutional Review Board, Northern Michigan University, Marquette, MI USA

## Signature Page

# Furthering Indonesian Higher Education through the Liberal Arts

“Pendidikan Umum dalam Menyongsong Generasi Emas Indonesia Tahun 2045”

By

Prof. A. Chaedar Alwasilah, M.A., Ph.D.

and

Prof. Judith Puncochar, Ph.D.

This report contains a summary of our collaborative academic efforts during fall semester 2014 at the Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia. We thank readers for taking time to read this report and we thank the generosity of many people who made this report possible. Any errors in the report are our own responsibility.

Professor A. Chaedar Alwasilah – an acclaimed scholar and celebrated thinker – dedicated the last years of his academic life to furthering Indonesian higher education through the Liberal Arts. Our report includes a summary of recommendations toward development of a greater Indonesia through the enhancement of Indonesian higher education. Let us seek fulfilment of Prof. Alwasilah’s vision over the coming years as we all work together toward realizing his legacy and creating a better Indonesia.

Professionally yours,



Prof. A. Chaedar Alwasilah, Ph.D. (chaedar\_alwasilah@upi.edu)  
Department of English Education  
Indonesia University of Education (UPI)  
Setyabudhi 229, Bandung 40154  
West Java, INDONESIA

November 22, 2014



Prof. Judith Puncochar, Ph.D. (jpuncoch@nmu.edu)  
School of Education, Leadership, & Public Service  
Northern Michigan University (NMU)  
1401 Presque Isle Ave.  
Marquette, Michigan USA 49855

21 January 2015

## Values of Higher Education

Indonesian universities have clear visions of excellence, innovation, and leadership in higher education. Many universities already have achieved national and international leadership roles. Leadership requires clearly articulated values<sup>7</sup>, benchmarks, and assessment of continuous quality improvement. Benchmarking and program evaluations are relatively easy to accomplish. Articulating the values necessary for education, national policies, and international influence is more difficult.

**Academic freedom.** Several threats to Indonesian higher education exist, but the greatest threat is to lose academic freedom. When rectors and deans hesitate to champion academic freedom, they risk leading a faculty fearful of innovation and at risk for stagnation in their teaching and research efforts. Scientific inquiry and peer review are of little help to faculty members who have lost academic freedom. Innovations in science and teaching require academic freedom and an associated willingness to take risks in the pursuit of new knowledge. Research and teaching of history, the arts, or science without a possibility to disconfirm conventional knowledge will result in teaching incomplete knowledge and restricted truths. An Indonesian university education would become increasingly narrow. Mission statements of universities would remain unrealized.

Tensions between academic freedom, the Pancasila, and sharia<sup>8</sup> will increase in Indonesian higher education. Loss of academic freedom places at risk, for example, the role of universities in setting national educational policies and a frank discussion of sharia and the five principles of the Indonesian Pancasila:

- Belief in the one and only God (*Ketuhanan Yang Maha Esa*).
- Just and civilized humanity (*Kemanusiaan Yang Adil dan Beradab*).
- The unity of Indonesia (*Persatuan Indonesia*).
- Democracy guided by the inner wisdom in the unanimity arising out of deliberations amongst representatives (*Kerakyatan Yang Dipimpin oleh Hikmat Kebijaksanaan, Dalam Permusyawaratan dan Perwakilan*)
- Social justice for all of the people of Indonesia (*Keadilan Sosial bagi seluruh Rakyat Indonesia*)

**University leadership.** University leaders must articulate the ideals of higher education and common shared values of the university community. When problems arise, people surrounding university leaders generally suggest solutions typical of attribution errors and hold individuals

---

<sup>7</sup> Puncocar, J. (2013). Observations on leadership, problem solving, and preferred futures of universities. *Education Leadership Review*, 14(1), 29-36. Retrieved from <http://www.ncpeapublications.org>

<sup>8</sup> Sijabat, R. M., & Simanjuntak, H. (January 9, 2015). Aceh lecturer threatened for pluralism stance. *The Jakarta Post*. <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/01/09/aceh-lecturer-threatened-pluralism-stance.html#sthash.cZEZ2vbM.dpuf>

accountable for problems. Suggested solutions are usually commonplace and include disciplinary action, hiring a different instructor, requiring permissions, monitoring activities and teaching plans, forming a task force, etc. Such conventional solutions tend to be unsustainable without constant vigilance and tend to benefit a single group more than the university as a whole.

Great university leaders champion the values of higher education and act as a humanizing force in higher education. They promote critical thinking, civic engagement, and respect for all university employees, students, and university community members. The values and ideals of higher education are sustainable and beneficial to many diverse groups.

### **Society for Enhancement of Indonesian Citizenry through Higher Education**

On November 22, 2014, Prof. A. Chaedar Alwasilah launched a society for the enhancement of Indonesian citizenry through furthering Indonesian higher education with the Liberal Arts. Representatives from seven universities were present to promote the society, including Institut Teknologi Bandung, Universitas Katolik Parahyangan, Universitas Kristen Maranatha, Universitas Pasundan, Telkom University, Universitas Pembangunan Jaya, Northern Michigan University, and Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia.

The vision of the Society is to return the MKDU to its historical roots in the Liberal Arts. The original Indonesian MKDU contained the Liberal Arts as foundational to a strong Indonesian democracy and well-educated citizenry<sup>9</sup>.

Recently, politicization of the term “Liberal Arts” has attracted unjustifiable criticism and has diverted attention from the need for a broadly educated citizenry with knowledge of science, literature, art, music, history, and mathematics. An informed, educated citizenry is important in a diverse democracy. Removing the Liberal Arts from the MKDU resulted in a rapid narrowing of Indonesian higher education to technical and professional degrees. Immersing students in highly specialized classes at the expense of instruction in Liberal Arts classes will risk producing a citizenry without a strong sense of rational thinking or social responsibility. Narrowly educating university students does *not* align with the Indonesian goal of *Unity in Diversity*.

A second controversy exists over the origins of the original *artes liberales* of today’s Liberal Arts. The original *artes liberales* included the *trivium* (grammar, logic, and rhetoric) and *quadrivium* (arithmetic, geometry, astronomy, and music). Some historians argue that the *artes liberales*

---

<sup>9</sup> Puncocar, J. (November 22, 2014). *Creating a National Society for the Enhancement of Indonesian Citizenry: Furthering the liberal arts in higher education*. Keynote Address for Launching a National Society at Yayasan Sahabat Lingkungan Hidup (EcoCamp), Bandung, Indonesia.

originated in Ancient Egypt as early as 4,400 to 4,000 BCE and included the study of religion<sup>10</sup>. Historian Martin Bernal posits that ancient Egyptians and Phoenicians (Syria) colonized Greece and that the ancient Egyptians brought several concepts to Greece including geometry, which was used to measure boundary markers of fields flooded by the Nile River<sup>11</sup>. Other historians attribute the focus on rationality of the *artes liberales* to ancient Greece.

Regardless of the origin of the *artes liberales*, the concept of Liberal Arts has withstood the test of time. Western education embraced the Liberal Arts as the basis of democracy, rational thinking, scientific-inquiry, and the foundation of evidence-based reasoning indicative of a disciplined yet innovative mind. A rigorous study of the Liberal Arts serves a public purpose and creates socially responsible, community-oriented, educated persons.

Currently, Hong Kong, Japan, South Korea, and Singapore are investing heavily in Liberal Arts education at a time when the United States has fewer students enrolling in Liberal Arts colleges and more students worrying more about obtaining technical and professional jobs than about becoming broadly educated<sup>12</sup>. If this current trend continues, Asia will soon outpace the United States in quality of university and postgraduate education. A liberal arts education is worthy of Indonesian taxpayers' rupiahs as an investment in Indonesia's future.

Indonesian universities have a responsibility to serve the public purpose and foster the development of citizens with civic responsibility, which is the primary goal of the Liberal Arts. If universities are reticent to embrace the term *Liberal Arts*, then universities could consider using *Citizenship Education* as an alternative term for the Liberal Arts. Universities using the term *Citizenship Education* for the Liberal Arts run a risk of weakening the focus on the Liberal Arts as the strongest foundation of highly diverse democratic society. Rigorous study of the Liberal Arts at the university level will help Indonesian citizens strive to achieve peaceful, cooperative, respectful solutions to the nation's toughest problems.

### **Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum (MKDU) as Liberal Arts**

Students at Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia and Universitas Pasundan want an education beyond narrow preparation in their majors. Prof. Alwasilah and Prof. Puncochar team-taught four S2 and S3 graduate classes at the Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia (UPI), and Prof. Puncochar co-taught

---

<sup>10</sup> Cook, W. S. (2014). A comparative analysis between the Nile Valley's liberal arts tradition and the development of western education. *Journal of Black Studies* 45, 683-707. doi:10.1177/0021934714550398

<sup>11</sup> Bernal, M. (1987). *Black Athena: Afroasiatic roots of classical civilization, Volume I: The fabrication of Ancient Greece, 1785-1985*. Rutgers University Press, p. 173. ISBN 978-0-8135-1277-8

<sup>12</sup> Lewis, P. (2013). Asia invests in liberal arts: US higher education expands abroad. *Harvard International Review*. Retrieved from <http://www.yale-nus.edu.sg/wp-content/uploads/2013/09/HIR-Asia-invests-in-liberal-arts.pdf>

one S1 course at the Universitas Pasundan (UNPAS) during fall semester 2014. The students in these classes expressed strong interest in studying Liberal Arts coursework<sup>13</sup>. Indeed, 95.7% of S1 students and 86.4% of S2 students listed Liberal Arts classes as preferred classes that they would take if they could. MKDU instructors in their S3 classes sent numerous emails and showed enthusiastic interest in learning how to “teach for learning” using student-centered Liberal Arts lessons.

Our S2 and S3 students were eager to learn skills of debate, conflict resolution, and constructive controversy, and they lack confidence in their opinions and knowledge of art, mathematics, and science. We assigned S2 and S3 students homework to write letters to the Indonesian Minister of Education and Culture on an educational issue of their choice. Students shared how they grappled with fear that initially paralyzed them from speaking up<sup>14</sup>. In an Indonesian democracy, Indonesians have the right to ask for what they want. Knowledge of their rights is interesting, but is powerful only when students act on and practice their knowledge. Students need to know that they have the right to ask for what they want, they need to know how to use their knowledge to affect positive change and resolve conflicts constructively, and they need to know that speaking up is necessary in a participatory democracy<sup>15</sup>. A rigorous study of the Liberal Arts provides the democratic skills of civic engagement, resolving controversies constructively, debate, logic, and effective problem solving.

UPI faculty focus group members expressed support for Liberal Arts coursework, learning outcomes, and teaching strategies. They agreed that current university students obtain a narrow, highly specialized education. Indonesia’s greatest threat to democracy is to educate citizens narrowly without knowledge of Indonesian history, ecology, culture, and literature and without skills of debate, logic, evidence-based reasoning, and problem solving. Indonesians need to understand the power of music, rhetoric, and social influence to affect human emotion and social criticism offered through the arts. Indonesians should have skills to apply mathematics and evidence-based scientific inquiry to all aspects of life.

Indonesia should have the Great Books of Indonesia and Indonesians should have an

---

<sup>13</sup> Puncuchar, J. (October 15, 2014). *Memajukan liberal arts di pendidikan tinggi Indonesia (Furthering liberal arts in Indonesian higher education)*. Keynote Address for the Seminar Nasional Jurusan Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum (National Seminar on Foundational University Studies) “Pendidikan Umum dalam Menyongsong Generasi Emas Indonesia Tahun 2045” (“General Studies for Building a Golden Generation in Indonesia by the Year 2045”). Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, Indonesia.

<sup>14</sup> Puncuchar, J. (November 22, 2014). *Creating a National Society for the Enhancement of Indonesian Citizenry: Furthering the liberal arts in higher education*. Keynote Address for Launching a National Society at Yayasan Sahabat Lingkungan Hidup (EcoCamp), Bandung, Indonesia.

<sup>15</sup> Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi dan Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan. (2013). *Standar Nasional Pendidikan Tinggi* [National Standards for Higher Education]. Retrieved from [http://bsnp-indonesia.org/id/wp-content/uploads/2013/07/Revisi-Draft-Permendikbud-SNPT-\\_11-Juli-2013\\_-2-ke-BSNP-\\_1\\_\\_2\\_.pdf](http://bsnp-indonesia.org/id/wp-content/uploads/2013/07/Revisi-Draft-Permendikbud-SNPT-_11-Juli-2013_-2-ke-BSNP-_1__2_.pdf)

opportunity to read the Great Books of Indonesia. A highly educated Indonesian citizenry needs knowledge of their culture and skills to build a peaceful, ecological, cooperative, respectful, and economically fair, transparent, and safe society. The level of knowledge and skills necessary for strong Indonesian universities starts with a rigorous student-centered study of the Liberal Arts of Indonesia. The Liberal Arts of Indonesia will produce an educated Indonesian citizenry with skills for moral and ethical reasoning, critical thinking, problem solving and decision-making, creativity, collaboration, and civic engagement.

### **Structure of Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum (MKDU) at UPI**

Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum (MKDU) is a program of general education classes. UPI directors and instructors of MKDU classes met during fall 2014 for a series of faculty focus groups facilitated by Dr. Abas Asyafah, UPI Director of the MKDU. Focus group discussion topics included the structure of the MKDU program at UPI, teaching methods, curriculum, and assessment of MKDU classes.

The UPI MKDU program consists of three classes mandated by Indonesian law (i.e., religion, Pancasila, and Bahasa Indonesia) and three or four other classes: sports, social-cultural, arts appreciation (cancelled), community service, and English (not required for English majors). Some UPI MKDU classes could function as Liberal Arts classes when redesigned with student-centered instruction and higher level reasoning strategies. Current UPI MKDU classes are missing important Liberal Arts subjects. Mathematics, history, natural science, literature, and visual and performing arts classes are basic to Liberal Arts programs, but are no longer part of the current UPI MKDU.

One of three UPI MKDU classes mandated by Indonesian law combines a study of the Pancasila and civics. Pancasila and civics topics each receive one credit of the two-credit Pancasila + Civics MKDU class. The Pancasila portion of the class addresses the philosophical framework of Indonesia as a nation. The civics portion of the class seeks to instill a sense of patriotism. An assessment of student patriotism is unavailable. UPI MKDU Pancasila + Civics classroom students do not participate in community activities involving political, civic, or democratic processes as part of their classwork. Expecting patriotism from Civics classwork in the absence of civic engagement in the community is unconvincing. Civic engagement involves working to make a difference in the civic life of Indonesian communities. Civic life includes the democratic processes Indonesian citizens associate with government, politics, and creating legislative policy. University students should have opportunities to engage in civic life in their communities through both political and non-political processes<sup>16</sup>. Civic engagement benefits university students' knowledge, skills, values, and motivations associated with civic life, community members' awareness of civic life, and overall

---

<sup>16</sup> Ehrlich, T. (2000). *Civic Responsibility and Higher Education*. Phoenix, AR: Oryx Press. Preface, page vi.

Indonesian democratic processes. A civics lesson, for example, could involve training high school students to conduct voter registration campaigns<sup>17</sup>.

Paradoxically, the MKDU class that is most visibly associated with Indonesian culture and the Liberal Arts no longer exists. Lecturers in MKDU art classes were from widely diverse areas of expertise (e.g., sculpture, music, film, painting, or dance), resulting in program assessment issues and cancelation of the class.

Pendidikan Lingkungan Sosial Budaya Teknologi (PLSBT) MKDU class combines a socio-cultural and environmental focus. The class strives to integrate students' knowledge across several disciplines, including social and natural sciences, but science faculty members do *not* teach the class. The class has a sociological perspective for both social and environmental issues.

Sports are included in the MKDU. Most universities throughout the world require students to take sports. A discussion of the MKDU sports class did not occur in the UPI faculty focus groups.

UPI religion classes comprise four credits of MKDU coursework and focus on the single religion associated with university students enrolled in the class (e.g., Muslim students take religion classes in Islam and Catholic students take classes in Catholicism). The two-credit Bahasa Indonesia class has a focus on grammar. A Social Service class has two credits and a community-service orientation using groupwork. The next sections contain descriptions of the religion, Bahasa Indonesia, and Social Service classes and some recommendations for improvements in teaching and changes to the curriculum of these classes.

MKDU at UPI consists of eight or nine required classes of 16-18 credits. English language majors do not take the MKDU English class. Other universities have different MKDU configurations.

Religion Education (2 credits)	Pendidikan Agama (2 SKS)
Seminar on Religion (2 credits)	Seminar Agama (2 SKS)
Indonesian Language (2 credits)	Pendidikan Bahasa Indonesia (2 SKS)
English Language (2 credits) [Not required for English Majors]	Bahasa Inggris (2 SKS)
Pancasila + Civics (2 credits)	Pancasila + Kewarganegaraan (2 SKS)
PLSBT (2 credits)	PLSBT (2 SKS)
Social Service (2 credits)	Layanan Sosial (2 SKS)
Sports (2 credits)	Olahraga (2 SKS)
Art (2 credits) – Eliminated	Seni (2 SKS)

Figure 1. Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia's Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum with associated credits.

<sup>17</sup> Tillotson, T., & Puncocar, J. (under review, 2014). Campaign simulation to increase high school students' skills for civic engagement. *The Social Studies*.

## Recommendations for MKDU Religion Classes

Current Indonesian university students enroll in MKDU religion classes based on students' religious affiliation on their Indonesian Identity Card. International students without a religious affiliation can receive exemptions from enrolling in the religion classes<sup>18</sup>. The purpose of MKDU religion classes is to instill a religious understanding of students' own religion and a respect for all people worldwide. Religion classes do not assess students' moral reasoning or students' religious literacy of religions other than their own. Instructors of MKDU religion classes are religious leaders whose knowledge of religion and teaching vary.

Religious literacy is an understanding of the basic tenets of the world's major religions, whereas, religious illiteracy is a lack of understanding of the basic tenets of world religions. Teaching about world religions promotes respect for diversity, understanding, and cooperation in local, national, and global arenas<sup>19</sup>. A lack of knowledge about other religions contributes to a difficulty in understanding ethics as independent of religion<sup>20</sup>. Religious illiteracy fuels misunderstandings between a study of religions and the practice of religions. These misunderstandings are due in part to inconsistency in expertise of religious leaders who are naïve about other religions. Ignorance of other religions promotes religious illiteracy and increases prejudice, bias, and antagonism.

The development of moral reasoning starts early in childhood. Young children follow rules and authority figures to receive praise and avoid punishment. Children gradually develop their cognitive thinking. Older children observe people in authority make and/or enforce or not enforce rules<sup>21</sup>. An authority figure has a strong influence on behavior<sup>22</sup>. University students who follow rules of an "authority" without examination can become victims of dangerous activities. MKDU religion classes strive to inculcate positive values of religion and encourage students to have positive attitudes and demonstrate constructive behaviors indicative of good Indonesian citizenship. Explicit training in the development of *moral reasoning* (as opposed to following rule-based morality) appears absent from religion classes and is not part of the religion class assessment.

Indonesian laws require universities to teach religion, but these laws do *not* mandate teaching strategies. Indonesian universities must consider several questions related to teaching

---

<sup>18</sup> C. Alwasilah (personal communication, October 19, 2014).

<sup>19</sup> Haynes, C. H. (2005). Living with our deepest differences: Religious diversity in the classroom. In D. A. Byrnes & G. Kiger (Eds.), *Common bonds: Anti-bias teaching in a diverse society, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition*. Wheaton, MD: Association for Childhood Education International.

<sup>20</sup> Moore, D. L. (2010). Guidelines for teaching about religion in K-12 public schools in the United States. *AAR Religion in the Schools Task Force. American Academy of Religion*.  
<https://www.aarweb.org/sites/default/files/pdfs/Publications/epublications/AARK-12CurriculumGuidelines.pdf>

<sup>21</sup> Piaget, J. (1932). *The moral judgment of the child*. New York, NY, US: Free Press.

<sup>22</sup> Cialdini, R. B. (2000). *Influence: Science and practice, 4<sup>th</sup> edition*, Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.

classes on religion. Are Indonesian universities a place for free exchange of ideas about religion? Should religion classes have a multi-religious education approach based on the Pancasila? Is requiring university students to spend their tuition rupiahs for studying their own religion ethical? Should religion instructors conduct multicultural lessons on Indonesia's official religions for students to learn more about Indonesia's diverse society? Should religion instructors conduct inter-faith forums and invite representatives of Indonesia's official religions to discuss topics of typical interest to university students (e.g., environment, marriage, science, technology, death, food, peace and war)? Should universities conduct an annual diversity conference and include religious diversity, e.g., "Uniting Neighbors in the Experience of Diversity" (UNITED)<sup>23</sup>?

Strategies for teaching religion classes need clarification. Approved teaching strategies for religion classes require continuous assessment for quality and improvement of teaching effectiveness. Universities also should require pre- and post-assessments of students' cognitive and moral reasoning to measure effectiveness of university religion classes and instruction. Students should have an opportunity to evaluate class instruction and content and suggest improvements to the religion class.

### **Recommendations for Teaching Bahasa Indonesia in the MKDU**

Bahasa Indonesia class has a focus on grammar and prepares students with basic skills for success in academic writing. Writing is hard to do well at all levels – undergraduate, graduate, and professor. The course is laudatory for the attempts to improve writing and for collecting student ratings of the courses. Eleven Bahasa Indonesia instructors provide classes for 6000 UPI undergraduates each year. The massive number of students relative to few instructors available to teach makes giving meaningful feedback to improve students' writing nearly impossible. The instructors work hard and deserve acclamation. Changes to the current structure and approach to teaching Bahasa Indonesia are necessary to improve university students' Bahasa Indonesia writing and speaking skills.

#### **Create an Indonesia Languages Research Institute**

Conduct research and assessment on Bahasa Indonesia instruction effectiveness and students' language proficiency. Hire an institutional language researcher (Ph.D.) to keep UPI statistics on Bahasa Indonesia proficiency and establish a baseline of Bahasa Indonesia. Establish a base line of native languages in addition to a baseline of Bahasa Indonesia. Hire a linguistics researcher (Ph.D.) of ethnic language preservation. Language unifies a nation, but university

---

<sup>23</sup> Puncchar, J. (2013). Chair of Uniting Neighbors in the Experience of Diversity (UNITED) Conference Planning Committee, Northern Michigan University, Marquette, MI. Retrieved from <http://www.nmu.edu/unity>

students need to know what is lost when a language dies. Indonesia will lose a national treasure when Javanese, Sundanese, and other languages disappear.

### **Create University Writing Center**

Create a university Writing Center with a large room to accommodate several desks, computers, wireless Internet access, and comfortable chairs to serve students and faculty from all university disciplines (e.g., science, mathematics, languages, history, technology, engineering, and literature). Staff the Writing Center with excellent undergraduate and graduate scholarship students as writing tutors. Create a university Study Skills Program (non-credit bearing) for extra student support outside of Bahasa Indonesia MKDU classes to help students who have poor grammar skills.

### **Establish Hiring Preferences**

Give hiring preferences to university lecturers who have at least three years of primary through secondary classroom teaching experience. Primary and secondary teachers have had training and practice in delivering student-centered instruction, effective feedback, and assessment of learning.

### **Redirect the Current Focus on Grammar**

Grammar is a set of rules to explain appropriate use of words in a language. Knowing grammar is important for students to judge how well speech or writing follows conventional rules of grammar. Students who see grammar rules in context of a written paragraph are more likely to learn grammar rules and transfer knowledge of grammar outside the classroom than are those students who see grammar rules in isolated sentences<sup>24</sup>. Consequently, teach grammar within literature. Bahasa Indonesia classes should use the Great Books of Indonesia for teaching grammar and writing. Do *not* teach grammar as a separate topic. Student writing will improve more rapidly when the student initially ignores grammar, handwriting quality, and spelling. Write first, edit second. Handwritten essays are superior to essays created on word processors unless students have well-developed word processing skills<sup>25</sup>. A review of basic Bahasa Indonesia grammar is a waste of time in a university Bahasa Indonesia class. Students who need basic grammar training and skills should go to the Writing Center for additional support.

### **Bahasa Indonesia and the Liberal Arts**

MKDU Bahasa Indonesia classes provide an opportunity to teach the Liberal Arts of Grammar, Rhetoric, and Dialectic (Logic):

---

<sup>24</sup> De La Paz & Graham, 1997; Graham, Berninger, Weintraub, & Schafer, 1998

<sup>25</sup> Roblyer, M. D. (1997). Technology and the oops! effect: Finding a bias against word processing. *Learning and Leading With Technology*, 24(7), 14-16.

1. Teach GRAMMAR within literature – Grammar.
2. Within the Bahasa Indonesia course, have students WRITE about their understanding through READING great works of Indonesian literature – Rhetoric.
3. Have students demonstrate their use of grammar with ORAL communication (speeches), debate, constructive argumentation, and constructive controversy – Dialectic.

Conduct Bahasa Indonesia grammar instruction within the context of an analysis of Bahasa Indonesia literature. Examine the composition of writing in technical, narrative, expository, descriptive, or persuasive styles. Student assessment of Bahasa Indonesia skills should include oral communication rubrics (rhetoric/speech) and reading comprehension rubrics (dialectic/logic)<sup>26</sup>.

### **Social Services Engagement as an Expected MKDU Outcome**

Learning through Social Services engagement is an exciting “teaching for learning” methodology that incorporates service to the community and helps students gain a deeper understanding of course objectives, new knowledge, professional expertise, and moral / ethical reasoning while engaging in a community activity. University students participate in an organized service activity to meet identified community needs, reflect on service activities to gain further understanding of academic discipline and community, and obtain an *enhanced sense of personal values and civic responsibility*<sup>27</sup>.

An expected learning outcome for university students engaged in Social Service activities is intercultural knowledge competence. University students should demonstrate cognitive, affective, and behavioral skills appropriate for interaction in a variety of cultural contexts. Evaluations of intercultural knowledge competences should include pre- and post-assessments of students’ reasoning about diversity and the cognitive and social dynamics of prejudice and poverty.

#### **General Recommendations for Social Service Engagement**

1. Create guidelines on involvement of MKDU Social Service courses with religion-based organizations. Examine the ethics AND equity of “free student labor” (e.g., make sure non-profit public organizations and the diversity of religion-based organizations receive equitable attention).

---

<sup>26</sup> Association of American Colleges and Universities. (2010). *Value Rubrics*. Retrieved from <https://www.aacu.org/value-rubrics>

<sup>27</sup> Hatcher, J. A., & Bringle, R. G. (1997). Reflection: Bridging the gap between service and learning. *College Teaching*, 45(4), 153-158. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/27558861>

2. Create Social Service theme-based service activities with topics such as “gender,” “underserved youth,” “public health,” “environmental sustainability,” and “integrated use of business to solve social problems”. Grouping Social Service projects under big themes could be a useful focus for both MKDU instructors and students.
3. Create a calendar of Social Service events (e.g., poster presentations for students to present to students as a way to hone student research and presentation skills).

### **Curricular Recommendations for Social Service Engagement**

1. Create a syllabus template of MKDU courses and “honorize” courses for advanced students.
2. Base Social Service syllabi on “Quality Matters” rubric (an online checklist for online courses, which has a nice framework as a checklist for quality in general face-to-face courses). Include “ethical / moral” standards.
3. Increase the number of Social Service masters-level courses.
4. Create Social Service Grants and a Social Service application process for funding of Social Service projects.
5. Create an optional three-course Social Service sequence of classes resulting in a Social Service Certificate of Accomplishment for students who seek a competitive edge (e.g., in Business).

### **Administrative Recommendations for Social Service Engagement**

1. Create a Social Service Board for accreditation and tenure / promotion processes with the line of reporting directly to the Vice-Rector of Academic Affairs.
2. Form a Community Partner Advisory Board to keep an updated community partner network for Social Service projects. Administer an annual survey of community partners to keep current with community needs.
3. Invite a member of the UPI Curriculum Committee to serve on Social Service Board.
4. Establish a Social Service Master’s program in Public Administration or other civic-based graduate program.
5. Continue to assess how Social Service fits in the MKDU structure (e.g., as an essential critical thinking approach to adult learning).

### **Teaching Recommendations for Social Service Engagement**

1. Teach about the nature of prejudice and bias in addition to the sociological dynamics of poverty.
2. Connect Social Service to active learning initiatives of the university.

3. Conduct Social Service outreach and assess challenges that Social Service instructors face in working with community outreach activities.
4. Create a “Coffee / Tea with the Community” at an orientation for new lecturers so that Social Service instructors can meet community partners before an academic year begins.
5. Host an annual Social Service workshop for MKDU instructors on best practices to incorporate Social Service learning in their classes.

### **Student Recommendations for Social Service Engagement**

1. Launch a Student Awareness Campaign on Social Service (e.g., poster or PR campaign for students) to make Social Service–themed classes easier for students to see when they register for classes.

## **Teaching for Learning in University Classrooms**

University students report more learning and greater satisfaction with learning under the following conditions<sup>28</sup>:

1. Good teaching and high-quality interactions with faculty members
2. Challenging academic content and high expectations for success
3. Engagement with diversity
4. Higher-order learning using critical thinking, integrative learning, and reflective learning

Faculty members who teach in university classrooms should be mentors, teachers, and coaches, not “lecturers”. The term “lecturer” instills a false idea that lecturing is a goal. Such notions corrode the ideal of “teaching for learning”. University classrooms should be alive with student interaction, student-to-student learning, innovative thinking, reflections, debate, and lots of student practice of honing new ideas, solving problems, and making sustainable decisions. Instructors who teach for learning are interested in the development of their students’ learning. Too often Indonesian lecturers teach to a curriculum with lecture and very little student engagement with the lecture concepts. Indonesian higher education must hire classroom instructors who care about their students and who take time to plan quality instruction. Universities need to become humanizing institutions with caring instructors.

Caring instructors refuse to accept poor quality work. They have high standards for excellence in learning and they encourage student commitment to learning. Caring instructors give

---

<sup>28</sup> Pascarella, E. T., & Blaich, C. (March-April 2013). Lessons from the Wabash National Study of Liberal Arts Education. *Change: The Magazine of Higher Learning*. Retrieved from [http://www.changemag.org/Archives/Back%20Issues/2013/March-April%202013/wabash\\_full.html](http://www.changemag.org/Archives/Back%20Issues/2013/March-April%202013/wabash_full.html)

second and third chances for students to learn and relearn. Caring instructors show patience when students make mistakes and respond promptly to appropriate requests for help. Universities need caring instructors who know their students as human beings, plan student-centered lessons, and give quality feedback based to support development of student competencies.

Students need to feel intellectually engaged with their instructors. UPI university students have implemented several tips from our approach to “teaching for learning” in the students’ own secondary and tertiary classes:

1. Start and stop class on time. “When you are on time, you are late!” applies to instructors and students.
2. Give prompt, detailed feedback on homework (e.g., see “Research Article Critique” sample homework assignment with feedback).
3. Create a class email listserv and send messages, PowerPoint slides, outlines, and handouts from each class session.
4. Use student-centered lessons (e.g., groupwork that works, constructive controversies, reciprocal questioning, and team-assisted individualization).
5. Use quick warm-up activities at the start of each class (e.g., “What’s new and good with you?”) to engage students and build a classroom learning community.
6. Give frequent quizzes to assess students’ understanding of new knowledge. Collect the quiz answer sheets and give the quiz again so that students can share quiz answers with peers in groups for bonus points added to students’ individual quiz scores.
7. Allow students to write multiple drafts of major projects and give feedback on each draft.

Multiple drafts increase the opportunity for instructors to monitor students’ developing competencies. UPI students submitted at least three drafts of their final projects for instructor feedback. These final projects demanded evidence of higher-order thinking and challenged students to integrate their learning across disciplines. The projects required perspective taking and critical thinking (e.g., students researched arguments pro and con on a controversial topic of their choice and they designed mechanisms for collaborative group decision-making to resolve the controversy).

Indonesian university instructors teach too many credits (i.e., 12 credit hours). Instructors need time to engage productively in scholarship and service projects and time to prepare excellent student-centered classroom lessons. Good teaching requires time for instructors to learn how to incorporate student-centered teaching in their university classrooms. Universities should consider offering Release Time on a competitive basis for promising, qualified instructors to engage in scholarship of teaching and participate in instructional workshops with strategies for higher-level thinking and student-centered teaching.

## Research Proposal, Prospectus, Thesis, and Dissertation Guidelines

The recommended formatting of a thesis or dissertation in this document will result in more publications for faculty members and graduate students. Suggestions for thesis or dissertation defenses have potential to improve faculty productivity and ethical considerations of student finances and time.

Steps outlined in this section reduce the time required for thesis or dissertation processes. Research students should establish a reasonable timeline to complete various components of a research project and allow extra time at each step to maximize successful completion of the research project.

### Keywords

The following terms and explanations expand on recommended changes to thesis and dissertation process and defense.

**Research proposal.** A research proposal approved by a research advisor is a *prospectus*.

**Prospectus.** A prospectus is a research advisor approved research plan with a theoretical position, a well-founded relationship to previous research, and a logical research design that is ready for defense in front of a panel of the student's thesis or dissertation committee members. A prospectus is the first official step to securing permission to conduct a thesis or dissertation research project. The purpose of a prospectus is to convince a panel of research committee members that the proposed research is sound. Once the committee approves a prospectus, the committee has agreed to permit the student to conduct the research. For protection of the student, a research thesis or dissertation committee may *not* ask a student to conduct additional studies or collect additional data beyond the approved prospectus research design. The prospectus limits and defines the scope of the research project.

**Prospectus defense.** The prospect defense occurs on an agreed upon date before a panel of all committee members. Typically, a prospectus defense lasts one hour. A research student presents for 15 minutes and the committee discusses the research design for 45 minutes. The purpose of a prospectus defense is to have committee members reach consensus that the research project is promising and the research student has necessary skills to conduct the research. If prospectus approval is *not* possible, the student may *not* conduct the research. A research prospectus passes with majority agreement (i.e., two of three thesis members or three of five dissertation members). The research student can conduct the research, but consensus is preferable to majority rule.

**Thesis or dissertation defense.** The thesis or dissertation defense occurs on an agreed upon date before a panel of all committee members. Typically, a thesis defense lasts one hour and a dissertation defense lasts two hours. The thesis or doctoral student presents for 20 minutes. The

student's guests listen to the research presentation, ask questions, and leave after 30 minutes. The committee panel asks the student questions for the remaining time and votes by ballot (i.e., pass, pass with revisions, or not pass). A thesis or dissertation passes with majority agreement (i.e., two of three thesis members or three of five dissertation members).

### **Preliminary Steps**

Immediately after completion of necessary introductory research classes, a thesis or dissertation students should plan for successful completion of their research project. Several steps comprise the completion of a research proposal, prospectus, and thesis or dissertation:

1. The research student will review all information at the graduate school website. Download and read the guidelines
2. In consultation with a research advisor, the student will select the thesis topic(s) and identify thesis or dissertation committee members, who must be members of the Graduate Faculty. Thesis students should identify three members for their thesis committee (i.e., their research advisor and two other graduate faculty research members). Dissertation students should identify five members for their dissertation committee (i.e., their research advisor and four other graduate faculty research members).
3. The student will perform an initial literature review on the potential thesis topic and identify a direction for the research. Significant material resulting from the initial literature review will comprise an initial draft of the literature review for the Research Proposal.
4. Following completion of the Research Proposal literature review and in consultation with the research director, the student will identify a specific Research Question to pursue.

### **Prospectus**

The student will write a formal prospectus and include page numbers. A thesis prospectus is normally three to five single-spaced pages, not including references. The prospectus must include the following components:

**Introduction.** Provide the background of the research problem, state the purpose of the study, include a theoretical framework to support your research question(s), and summarize existing research related to the research question(s). The introduction sets the stage for the literature review.

**Literature review.** Present the literature review and develop the research hypotheses with support from the literature review.

**Research Design.** Create an appropriate research design to test your hypotheses. Include threats to validity. Outline a tentative design for how you intend to analyze your data and include suggested statistics. The details of the research design comprise an initial draft of the methodology

of the research.

**Timeline.** A proposed timeline for the study must identify a proposed defense date. The student and research director will coordinate the proposed defense date with faculty members' other defense dates to prevent an overload on faculty members of research committees. Failing to have the thesis or dissertation ready for defense by the proposed date may result in a significant rescheduling delay.

**Costs.** A statement concerning any costs associated with the study and funding for such costs. The student should discuss any potential costs with the research director prior to writing the prospectus.

**References.** Include a reference section in a style of the anticipated publication target journal, usually APA style for educational research.

The research student will submit drafts of the prospectus to the research director for review and editing. Expect the process to involve feedback, several drafts and re-writes. An approved Research Proposal is a Prospectus.

### **Prospectus Review**

When the Prospectus is ready, the research advisor and thesis or dissertation student will identify a thesis committee, which will act as both a prospectus review committee and a reading committee for the thesis or dissertation. The committee will consist of the student, research advisor, and a minimum of two additional graduate faculty members for a thesis committee, or a minimum or four additional graduate faculty for a dissertation committee. Guidelines for prospectus processes should be in the graduate bulletin and on the Graduate Office website. A successful defense is by majority vote.

**Prospectus committees.** For a thesis prospectus committee, at least one committee member should be outside the thesis student's research area to help ensure that the thesis is understandable to a broad range of researchers. Should one thesis committee member become unavailable due to resignation, leave, sabbatical, etc., a two-member thesis committee is acceptable for the latter stages of the thesis process, including the final defense.

For a dissertation prospectus committee, at least one dissertation committee member should be outside the doctoral student's research area to help ensure that the dissertation is understandable to a broad range of researchers. Should one dissertation committee member become unavailable due to resignation, leave, sabbatical, etc., a four-member dissertation committee is acceptable for the latter stages of the dissertation process, including the final defense.

**Scheduling the prospectus defense.** The research student with the help of the research advisor will schedule a meeting with committee members to review the prospectus. The research

student will distribute the prospectus to committee members digitally (or with paper by request of committee members) at least one (1) week prior to the scheduled meeting.

**Purpose of the prospectus defense.** The purpose of the Prospectus meeting is to help the research student clarify the design of the research. The aim is to be constructive and catch any mistakes at an early stage. The prospectus meeting will provide all committee members an opportunity to discuss the proposed project with the research student. The research student will prepare and deliver a 15-minute oral description of the research project:

1. Briefly review the background and significance of the research problem, theoretical background, research question(s), highlights of the research literature review, and resulting identification of the research hypotheses.
2. Review the proposed methodology, intended controls of threats to validity, and data analysis procedures. Include information on characteristics of proposed research participants, if any.
3. Summarize the importance of the study.
4. Use MS PowerPoint slides and/or other helpful visuals for the project description as needed.

**During the prospectus defense.** Committee members will ask questions, make comments, and expect the research student to respond to queries regarding the project. Committee members will agree to any changes to the research design before they approve the start of the research student's project. Once the committee approves the prospectus, they complete and sign the Thesis or Dissertation Research Approval Form.

**After the prospectus defense.** The research student submits the Research Approval Form to the department head for approval. In addition, the research student will write a letter to the Department Head to accompany the Research Approval Form. The letter will include a summary paragraph describing the research, names of committee members, and a few lines describing how each committee member will contribute her or his expertise to the committee.

**Significance of an approved prospectus.** An approved prospectus is a "contract". Committee members are likely to approve a prospectus based on research executed from an approved prospectus. Research students who include research not approved at the prospectus meeting run the risk that much time spent gathering data will not be useful for the research defense. As in all real-world research, findings may indicate a need for a new direction or change in plans. The research student can renegotiate an approved prospectus as long as all committee members approve any changes. The research student is responsible to keep committee members informed.

**Statute of limitations.** A statute of limitations on an approved prospectus is normally two years. If a research student takes a leave of absence or withdraws from graduate study, he or she

should consult with the committee to make certain a previously approved prospectus is still in force.

### **Data Collection**

Once the committee approves the prospectus, the research student may proceed with the project under supervision of the research advisor.

The student first must obtain appropriate approval to conduct the research project *prior to collection of any data*. Appropriate approval must come from the University Institutional Review Board (IRB) for research involving human subjects. In research involving animals, the research student must seek approval by the Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee. Approvals can take up to six weeks before data collection can begin. Application forms are available on the Graduate Office website. A Frequently Asked Questions document has helpful information.

During the data collection phase of the research, the research student will interact mainly with the research advisor. The research advisor will decide if any committee meetings are necessary prior to the final defense date.

### **Registering for Research Credits**

Registration for one or more thesis or dissertation credit(s) initiates a structured progress toward completion of the master's or doctoral student's degree. The research student should read all information available at the Graduate Office website for completing a research defense successfully.

The research student should contact her or his research advisor before registering for research credits. Grades for research are "R" (research in progress) until the Committee approves the final research project and assigns a final grade.

If the research student does not complete the final thesis or dissertation by the end of the semester in which he or she registers for the last research credit, a "continuous enrollment" policy takes effect. The research student must enroll for one credit of Continuing Research each semester until the research student completes the final defense and the Graduate Office approves the final thesis or dissertation. All "R" grades expire after three years.

If the research student does not complete the thesis or dissertation within three years of the first semester of an "R" grade, the research student must repeat the R-graded credit.

### **Writing the Thesis or Dissertation**

The research student will prepare a written thesis or dissertation in a Manuscript Format ready for submission to a specific and appropriate scientific journal for publication consideration. The Manuscript Format for the thesis or dissertation is included at the end of this document. Refer to the American Psychological Association's *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association* (i.e., use the current edition of the APA Manual) for the "how to" of APA formatting,

which is the primary style used in most education and psychology journals.

The final document must adhere to *Guidelines* from the university Graduate Office. When differences in format exist between the specific journal's instructions and the *Thesis or Dissertation Guidelines*, the latter take preference. Guidelines are available at the Graduate Office website. The research student should submit drafts of thesis or dissertation document in electronic format to the research advisor for comments.

Generally, the research advisor will accept early drafts of the research in portions (i.e., Journal Manuscript, Literature Review, Summary, and Conclusions) as the research student writes the sections. However, the research student immediately should begin writing the research in the required format of the Graduate Office. The research student should expect considerable revisions prior to submission of a final draft to the full committee.

### **Defense**

Upon acceptance of a final written draft by the research advisor, a research student will schedule the Final Defense with the committee. The research student will distribute copies of the final draft to all committee members *at least two weeks prior* to the scheduled defense. At the Defense, the research student will present a 20-minute review of the research project. This review should include a brief introduction, description of the methodology, results, interpretation, and conclusions. The research student should prepare a presentation similar to a presentation at a professional conference. Use of slides, transparencies, or PowerPoint visual aids is acceptable. Following the presentation, the research student will take questions from anyone in attendance. After the general question period, guests leave at the discretion of the committee and the research student meets with the committee to discuss the work. This discussion will determine if the committee will approve the final thesis or dissertation and whether the research student must make final changes prior to submission of the thesis or dissertation to the Graduate Office.

### **Publishing Thesis or Dissertation Research**

Following the defense, the research student will attend to any final recommendations and requirements specified by the committee. The research student will process the necessary final copies of the thesis or dissertation on *ProQuest*. The final copies (usually electronic files) must adhere to the requirements of the Graduate Office Guidelines. The research student will obtain appropriate signatures for the Research Approval Page and submit the final thesis or dissertation by the appropriate deadline (30 days prior to the date of graduation).

Customarily, the research student delivers one copy of the final thesis or dissertation to the research advisor and other members of the committee. Check with individual committee members for their preference of the final thesis or dissertation in electronic or hard copy.

Research students should publish their research in a pre-selected journal. Lead authors are the recent thesis and doctoral graduates with the research advisor and/or committee members serving as coauthors.

Research students must fund expenses and instrumentation needs for their research. The university should support internal competitive research funding programs for student research. Submission procedures should be available on the Graduate Office website.

Thesis and dissertation requirement is time consuming, demanding, and professionally exhilarating. Skills a research student hones from writing a thesis and a dissertation are transferable to grant writing and doctoral or post-doctoral programs.

A thesis or dissertation is a “study in excellence”. The research advisor and committee are likely to force a very high degree of quality in the research project. The research student should expect to work through several drafts, edits, and revisions during the process of completing the final thesis or dissertation. The research student and research advisor will expend much effort to make the final product as excellent as possible.

### Writing Resources

American Psychological Association (2009). *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association* (6th ed.). Available from the NMU Bookstore

Day, R. A. (2006). *How To Write and Publish a Scientific Paper*. Retrieved from <http://books.google.com>

Galvan, J. L. (2009). *Writing literature reviews: A guide for students of the social and behavioral sciences* (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). Glendale, CA: Pycszak Pub. Available from the NMU Bookstore

## Formatting a Thesis or Dissertation

Page(s)	Title/Subtitle or General Content	Additional Notes
i	Title page	Number not printed on title page
ii	Abstract with key words	Page numbers lower case Roman, bottom center of page.
iii	Acknowledgments	Optional page. Continue lower case Roman page numbers.
iv . . .	Table of Contents	Continue lower case Roman page numbers.
	List of Figures	Continue lower case Roman page numbers.
	List of Tables	Continue lower case Roman page numbers.

1 . . .	<p>CHAPTER I LITERATURE REVIEW includes a justification of the problem/study and a complete literature review. With some modification, you might submit this Review as a standalone paper to a journal. Must specify style used for intended journal (Chapter II) and when journal style departs from APA style.</p> <p>CHAPTER II (Manuscript format for submission for publication). No title page for the manuscript. Include Introduction Methods Results Discussion. (Do not include the Reference list for the journal at this point, but keep one on file for submission with the manuscript to the journal.) Use the master reference list for the full Thesis or Dissertation (see comment below). Be sure to modify your Reference list for the journal before submitting for publication.</p> <p>A dissertation may require two or more research studies submitted to the same or different journals.</p> <p>CHAPTER III CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</p> <p>FULL REFERENCE LIST Combine cited references for the journal manuscript and Thesis or Dissertation Literature Review into one master list.</p>	<p>Full comprehensive literature review as in the traditional thesis Chapter II. Includes full reference list.</p> <p>Written as per submission to a preselected journal. Identify the intended journal by name. Prepare the manuscript according to the specific journal's Instructions for Authors. Begin Arabic page numbers and continue throughout.</p> <p>Similar to a Traditional Thesis or Dissertation Chapter V.</p>
---------	---	--

### **Community Ventures with University Competitive Grants**

University community members (professors, lecturers, students, and staff) should have opportunities to compete for university grants to work for the greater good of Indonesia and higher education. Such opportunities could involve for-profit or non-profit agencies to increase the positive social impact of education, medicine, civic engagement, environmental conservation efforts, etc.

Award-winning professors and lecturers who have established themselves as excellent educators could apply for funding to go into the community and give talks. University educators could bring easily understandable knowledge to common people in their communities. A university education should be available for the masses and not restricted to a few economically privileged students. Indonesians from all backgrounds could meet in a civic center and listen to leading university faculty members give talks on citizenship education, good health habits, hygiene, preservation of ethnic languages, prevention of air pollution, how to write an effective letter, child development, improving memory, space travel, etc.

Students and university instructors could seek out and create community partnerships with organization involved with community outreach, e.g., Eco Learning Camp has trainings for science educators to conduct inquiry-based ecology lessons.

Winners of university grants would represent their departments or offices at a university-

sponsored celebration of research and creative works.

### **Indonesian Civic Fellows Scholarship**

Advocate for national recognition of civic engagement in higher education. Establish a scholarship award for inspiring Indonesian undergraduates who are leaders in motivation and ability to make substantial contributions toward finding solutions for challenges facing communities throughout the country. These students represent the next generation of public problem solvers and civic leaders. They serve as national examples of the role that higher education has in building a better world. Students must provide evidence beyond traditional service activities in their community involvement classes. They are making the most of their civic engagement to find root causes of social issues and effective mechanisms for creating lasting change. Each rector would nominate one student as an outstanding representative worthy of induction into a nationally recognized group of student leaders. Each student leader would represent one Indonesian campus and would receive an award certificate and invitation to join the Indonesian Civic Fellows national society. Higher education and national websites would feature Indonesian Civic Fellows prominently. Indonesian Civic Fellows would receive invitations to participate in state-specific activities as appropriate.

### **Outcomes Assessment of Higher Education Learning**

The goal of a university Liberal Arts education is to prepare citizens to live responsible, productive, and creative lives in a democracy and changing world. To measure the effectiveness of a Liberal Arts education, Indonesian universities must develop systematic, rubric-guided assessments based on nationally recognized standards to evaluate student learning<sup>29</sup>. Rubrics provide a direct measure of student behavior and knowledge. One possible assessment procedure (of many) would use a stratified random sampling at confidence levels of 95% to select student work for evaluation. The selection process would maintain student and instructor anonymity. The university's evaluation team would address concerns of university faculty and complete the continuous improvement feedback loop by informing university faculty and administrators of assessment results. Results would refine class content and ready university faculty for the next round of outcome assessments. The procedure would result in an assessment system for benchmarking Liberal Arts outcomes evident in student work (e.g., inquiry skills and integrative knowledge processes).

---

<sup>29</sup> Puncochar, J., & Klett, M. (2013). A model for outcomes assessment of undergraduate science knowledge and inquiry processes. *Research & Practice in Assessment*, 8(2), 42-54. Retrieved from <http://www.rpajournal.com/>

Outcomes assessment should offer insights into the effect of university programs without additional burdening of faculty or supplementary testing of students. In particular, universities should study the impact of the MKDU on teacher education programs and on beginning teachers leaving their university programs. Have first-year university students learned what lecturers taught and are first-year students doing what they learned?

Assessing an entire program of Liberal Arts is important, but equally important is the assessment of critical thinking and learning outcomes within each Liberal Arts class. The figure below is one example of several possible configurations of Liberal Arts categories within a Liberal Arts program<sup>30</sup>. Several excellent rubrics are available to assess Liberal Arts learning outcomes<sup>31</sup>.

<b>Liberal Arts Categories</b>	<b>Critical Thinking + Other Learning Outcomes</b>
Communication (two or more classes 6 – 8 credits)	Effective Communication
Humanities (two or more classes 6 – 8 credits)	Perspectives in Society
Natural Sciences / Math (two or more classes 6 – 8 credits)	Scientific Inquiry
Social Sciences (two or more classes 6 – 8 credits)	Quantitative Reasoning
Formal Communication Studies (one or more classes 3 – 4 credits)	Integrative Thinking
Visual & Performing Arts (one or more classes 3 – 4 credits)	Human Expression

Figure 2. Liberal Arts categories and individual Liberal Arts classes require assessment of critical thinking and other learning outcomes.

### **Teacher Education Programs Have a Critical Need for the Liberal Arts**

The Liberal Arts plays a particularly important role in the education of primary school teachers. Indonesian history, culture, music, art, philosophy, and literature are foundational subjects in preparing preschool and elementary teachers for young children's insatiable curiosity. Teaching is an epistemological endeavor intended to cause children to develop their minds for scientific inquiry, logical thinking, and compassion for fellow humans. Elementary teachers need wide-ranging understandings and skills to provide young students with ample knowledge, skills, and reasons associated with learning.

Indonesia should expect teachers to promote the values of democracy, social justice, unity, and justice. University classes in Liberal Arts subjects (e.g., philosophy, history, sociology, science, mathematics, and literature) are appropriate venues for primary school educators to think through and discuss the importance of these concepts with concrete examples appropriate for children.

<sup>30</sup> Liberal Studies Committee. (2013). *Liberal Studies Program*. Northern Michigan University, Marquette, Michigan USA. Retrieved from <http://www.nmu.edu/acac/liberalstudies>

<sup>31</sup> Association of American Colleges and Universities. (2010). *Value Rubrics*. Retrieved from <https://www.aacu.org/value-rubrics>

Teachers need to understand how society influences education and how much power and influence they have in shaping the minds of Indonesia's citizens.

All Indonesian universities should include a rigorous study of the Liberal Arts in teacher education programs. Elementary education majors in the USA take more than 25% of their university credits as Liberal Arts credits. In Indonesia, the MKDU comprises about 9% of elementary education coursework, very little of which has a Liberal Arts focus.

## **Educational Policy Recommendations**

### **Create a Center for Teaching for Learning on Every University Campus**

Every university should have a Center for Teaching and Learning to support classroom instructors' use of technology for learning, student-centered lessons, and help with designing authentic assessments of students' learning. Universities with S3 programs should have a Preparing Future Faculty program to support beginning lecturers and train S3 students for effective "teaching for learning" in university classrooms while S3 students are in graduate school. Centers for Teaching and Learning should focus on the Scholarship of Teaching. Lesson Study and Learning Study are sweeping Asia. These qualitative research approaches to continuous quality improvement of teaching through reflective practice have merit for building cohorts of lecturers who want to publish research on teaching and form a learning community of teaching scholars.

### **Instill Liberal Arts in the MKDU**

A recommendation at the national level is to instill the Liberal Arts in the MKDU. Expanding access to Liberal Arts courses for undergraduates is important for the growth of Indonesia. The promise of a Liberal Arts education is wide-ranging for Indonesia and its citizens. Furthering the Liberal Arts in Indonesian higher education would help to prepare an educated citizenry with specific dispositions<sup>32</sup> to develop lifelong learning and improve knowledge, skills, and competence throughout the lifespan<sup>33</sup>:

- Developing a high degree of intellectual literacy;
- Honing critical-thinking skills;
- Exhibiting moral and ethical responsibility to one's community;
- Reasoning clearly, think rationally, analyze intelligently;

---

<sup>32</sup> Green, Howard and Matthew Green. *Hidden Ivies: Thirty Colleges of Excellence*. New York: Harper Collins, p. 12. Retrieved from <http://books.google.co.id/books>

<sup>33</sup> Commission of the European Communities. (2000). *A memorandum on lifelong learning*. Brussels, Belgium. Retrieved from [http://www.see-educoop.net/education\\_in/pdf/lifelong-oth-enl-t02.pdf](http://www.see-educoop.net/education_in/pdf/lifelong-oth-enl-t02.pdf)

- Responding to people with compassion and fairness;
- Appreciating beauty of the arts and literature;
- Using arts and literature as an inspiration or a solace;
- Reverting to the historical past for lessons to help shape the future intelligently and to avoid unnecessary mistakes;
- Reflecting on personal accomplishments with humility;
- Meeting challenges with observation, problem solving, and success.

Refer to MKDU sections of this report for recommendations concerning specific MKDU classes.

### **Return Art to the MKDU**

Art is a venue for communicating personal and cultural values and for understanding humanness. Through art, students learn to express their feelings, ideas, and creativity and appreciate the diversity of multiculturalism in Indonesia and learn how to criticize social and cultural phenomena of their world. Establish a baseline of undergraduate students' art proficiencies and their knowledge of Indonesian art forms, world art history, and art criticism. Establish a baseline of Indonesian art forms and hire an Indonesian art historian, art critic, and art researcher (Ph.D.). Teach art forms in university classrooms as unique methods of social inquiry and collective cultural memory.

Encourage the study of the arts in high schools. University undergraduates who took no arts classes in high school scored lower on the college entrance exams than students who participated in art classes. Undergraduates who took five or more semesters (more than two years) of the arts in high school classes scored the highest on the national college entrance exams<sup>34</sup>.

---

<sup>34</sup> Crawford, O., Schafer, D., & Puncuchar, J. (April 1-2, 2013). *The relationship between the arts and the ACT*. Poster presented at the National Conference on Undergraduate Research, University of Wisconsin-La Crosse. <http://www.ncur.org/students.htm>

## References

- Alwasilah, A. C. (2012, July 21). In Indonesia, liberal studies are unfortunately neglected. *Jakarta Post*. Retrieved from <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2012/07/21/in-indonesia-liberal-studies-are-unfortunately-neglected.html>
- Alwasilah, A. C., & Puncochar, J. (2014, October 9). *Assignment for the Liberal Arts Seminar: What are Indonesia's Great Books?* Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, West Java, Indonesia.
- American Psychological Association (2009). *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association* (6th ed.). Available from the NMU Bookstore
- Association of American Colleges and Universities. (2010). *Value Rubrics*. Retrieved from <https://www.aacu.org/value-rubrics>
- Association of American Colleges and Universities. (2014). *New report documents that Liberal Arts disciplines prepare graduates for long-term professional success*. Retrieved from <https://www.aacu.org/press/press-releases/new-report-documents-liberal-arts-disciplines-prepare-graduates-long-term>
- Bernal, M. (1987). *Black Athena: Afroasiatic roots of classical civilization, Volume I: The fabrication of Ancient Greece, 1785-1985*. Rutgers University Press, p. 173. ISBN 978-0-8135-1277-8
- Cialdini, R. B. (2000). *Influence: Science and practice*, 4<sup>th</sup> edition, Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Commission of the European Communities. (2000). *A memorandum on lifelong learning*. Brussels, Belgium. Retrieved from [http://www.see-educoop.net/education\\_in/pdf/lifelong-oth-enl-t02.pdf](http://www.see-educoop.net/education_in/pdf/lifelong-oth-enl-t02.pdf)
- Cook, W. S. (2014). A comparative analysis between the Nile Valley's liberal arts tradition and the development of western education. *Journal of Black Studies* 45, 683-707. doi:10.1177/0021934714550398
- Crawford, O., Schafer, D., & Puncochar, J. (April 1-2, 2013). *The relationship between the arts and the ACT*. Poster presented at the National Conference on Undergraduate Research, University of Wisconsin-La Crosse. <http://www.ncur.org/students.htm>
- Day, R. A. (2006). *How To Write and Publish a Scientific Paper*. Retrieved from <http://books.google.com>
- De La Paz & Graham, 1997; Graham, Berninger, Weintraub, & Schafer, 1998

- Ehrlich, T. (2000). *Civic Responsibility and Higher Education*. Phoenix, AR: Oryx Press. Preface, page vi.
- Galvan, J. L. (2009). *Writing literature reviews: A guide for students of the social and behavioral sciences* (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). Glendale, CA: Pycszak Pub. Available from the NMU Bookstore
- Hatcher, J. A., & Bringle, R. G. (1997). Reflection: Bridging the gap between service and learning. *College Teaching*, 45(4), 153-158. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/27558861>
- Haynes, C. H. (2005). Living with our deepest differences: Religious diversity in the classroom. In D. A. Byrnes & G. Kiger (Eds.), *Common bonds: Anti-bias teaching in a diverse society*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. Wheaton, MD: Association for Childhood Education International.
- Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi dan Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan. (2013). *Standar Nasional Pendidikan Tinggi* [National Standards for Higher Education]. Retrieved from [http://bsnp-indonesia.org/id/wp-content/uploads/2013/07/Revisi-Draft-Permendikbud-SNPT-\\_11-Juli-2013\\_-2-ke-BSNP-\\_1\\_\\_2\\_.pdf](http://bsnp-indonesia.org/id/wp-content/uploads/2013/07/Revisi-Draft-Permendikbud-SNPT-_11-Juli-2013_-2-ke-BSNP-_1__2_.pdf)
- Lewis, P. (2013). Asia invests in liberal arts: US higher education expands abroad. *Harvard International Review*. Retrieved from <http://www.yale-nus.edu.sg/wp-content/uploads/2013/09/HIR-Asia-invests-in-liberal-arts.pdf>
- Liberal Studies Committee. (2013). *Liberal Studies Program*. Northern Michigan University, Marquette, Michigan USA. Retrieved from <http://www.nmu.edu/acac/liberalstudies>
- Moore, D. L. (2010). Guidelines for teaching about religion in K-12 public schools in the United States. *AAR Religion in the Schools Task Force. American Academy of Religion*. <https://www.aarweb.org/sites/default/files/pdfs/Publications/epublications/AARK-12CurriculumGuidelines.pdf>
- Pascarella, E. T., & Blaich, C. (March-April 2013). Lessons from the Wabash National Study of Liberal Arts Education. *Change: The Magazine of Higher Learning*. Retrieved from [http://www.changemag.org/Archives/Back%20Issues/2013/March-April%202013/wabash\\_full.html](http://www.changemag.org/Archives/Back%20Issues/2013/March-April%202013/wabash_full.html)
- Piaget, J. (1032). *The moral judgment of the child*. New York, NY, US: Free Press.
- Puncochar, J. (2006, May 9-12). *Groupwork that works!* Michigan Mid-America Educational Opportunity Program Personnel. 32<sup>nd</sup> Annual Spring Conference, Northern Michigan University, Marquette, MI USA

- Puncochar, J. (2013). Chair of the Uniting Neighbors in the Experience of Diversity (UNITED) Conference Planning Committee, Northern Michigan University, Marquette, MI. Retrieved from <http://www.nmu.edu/united>
- Puncochar, J. (2013). Observations on leadership, problem solving, and preferred futures of universities. *Education Leadership Review*, 14(1), 29-36. Retrieved from <http://www.ncpeapublications.org>
- Puncochar, J. (2014). *Liberal Arts in Indonesian higher education*. Research Proposal Approval: HS14-616. Institutional Review Board, Northern Michigan University, Marquette, MI USA
- Puncochar, J. (November 22, 2014). *Creating a National Society for the Enhancement of Indonesian Citizenry: Furthering the liberal arts in higher education*. Keynote Address for Launching a National Society at Yayasan Sahabat Lingkungan Hidup (EcoCamp), Bandung, Indonesia.
- Puncochar, J. (October 15, 2014). *Memajukan liberal arts di pendidikan tinggi Indonesia (Furthering liberal arts in Indonesian higher education)*. Keynote Address for the Seminar Nasional Jurusan Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum (National Seminar on Foundational University Studies) "Pendidikan Umum dalam Menyongsong Generasi Emas Indonesia Tahun 2045" ("General Studies for Building a Golden Generation in Indonesia by the Year 2045"). Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, Indonesia.
- Puncochar, J., & Klett, M. (2013). A model for outcomes assessment of undergraduate science knowledge and inquiry processes. *Research & Practice in Assessment*, 8(2), 42-54. Retrieved from <http://www.rpajournal.com/>
- Roblyer, M. D. (1997). Technology and the oops! effect: Finding a bias against word processing. *Learning and Leading With Technology*, 24(7), 14-16.
- Setiadi, E. M., Hakam, K. A., & Effendi, R. (2006). *Ilmu sosial budaya dasar* [Sociology and the Foundations of Culture]. Jakarta, Indonesia: Kencana Prenadamedia Group, p. 3.
- Sijabat, R. M., & Simanjuntak, H. (January 9, 2015). Aceh lecturer threatened for pluralism stance. *The Jakarta Post*. <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/01/09/aceh-lecturer-threatened-pluralism-stance.html#sthash.cZE22vbM.dpuf>
- Tillotson, T., & Puncochar, J. (under review, 2014). Campaign simulation to increase high school students' skills for civic engagement. *The Social Studies*.